

Tokyo Medical and Dental University and Chulalongkorn University
International Joint Degree Doctor of Philosophy Program in Orthodontics

External Assessment Sheet

Term of the Assessment
August, 2018 - July, 2019

Evaluator name :

Dr. Koichi Kato and Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote

Contents

Preparing the External Assessment Sheet	1
--	----------

External Assessment

1. Mechanism for implementation of JD Program

1-1. Joint implementation structure	2
1-2. Policies	3
1-3. Quality assurance system	4

2. Operation of JD Program

2-1. Progress of JD Program operation	5
2-2. Fulfillment of student capacity	6
2-3. Syllabuses	7
2-4. Evaluation method and criteria	8

3. Student Support

3-1. Student support system	9
-----------------------------------	---

Conclusion	10
-------------------------	-----------

Purpose and Background

In 2015, Tokyo Medical and Dental University (hereinafter referred to as the “TMDU”) and Chulalongkorn University (hereinafter referred to as the “CU”) received authorizations from their Ministry of Education to establish a joint degree program (hereinafter referred to as “JDP”).

In 2016, the JDP specializing in orthodontics started, and it has been operated jointly by TMDU and CU. TMDU and CU, through this JDP, aim for training medical professionals with a rich international quality, and enhance the universities’ international profiles, presences and competitiveness.

The JDP focus on fostering professionals who understand the essentials of clinical dentistry and service, and who show promise as talented researchers and future leaders in ASEAN countries.

In the Program, which is different from the usual doctoral program, we offer a curriculum that will enable students to develop the high-quality research capabilities needed to qualify for an academic degree and the clinical skills necessary to become effective dental clinicians.

The Program will provide students high-quality supervision for research training, thesis development and writing. Students will be awarded one degree under the joint names of TMDU and CU after successful completion.

As a Quality assurance system of the program, we set three steps; 1. Self-assessment, 2. External assessment, 3. Faculty Development. Concerning the external assessment, we must undergo assessment by external experts to evaluate the status of program implementation and achievement and make improvements. To this end, we have set guidelines as below.

- University’s Quality Assurance System (hereinafter referred to as “System”) shall be established for the purpose of carrying out assessments of the JDP.
- The system shall assess the status of program implementation and achievement and suggest improvements.
- The system shall consist of persons with relevant knowledge, outsourcing veterans, professors from other universities who hold doctoral degrees in relevant fields and have experiences of granting doctoral degrees.

Dr. Koichi Kato, Dean, School of Dentistry of Hiroshima University and Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote, Dean, Faculty of Dentistry of Prince of Songkla University undertake the external assessors. This is a report of the assessment results.

External Assessment Method

Two external assessors assessed the status of project implementation/achievement and made comments on project achievements that are organized into eight assessment categories.

Assessment criteria is the same as the self-assessment report for the four categories, as shown below.

IV	Achieved more than was planned.
III	Plan was achieved.
II	Plan was not achieved sufficiently.
I	Plan was not achieved.

1. Mechanism for implementation of JD Program

Assessment Category

1-1. Joint implementation structure

(Self-assessment report page 2)

Criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Appropriate committees for discussing important matters of education activities and examining curricula and educational methods are organized and active. (1-1-1) ➤ Appropriate communication method is established. (1-1-2) 		
Self-assessment	Rating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The joint implementation structure has been very well established until now. ▪ Since last year, renovation of the implementation structure turned out to be well designed. Usual communications between the two universities have been well carried out by the regular teleconference and the exchange of the emails at appropriate timings. 	
	III		
External-assessment	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I	
	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> Joint implementation structure which was reformed into four committees in 2016 was well-designed. Among them, Liaison Council and Course Administrative Committee have regularly conducted meetings during 2018 – 2019 for discussing important matters.</p> <p>Communication between TMDU and CU has been smoothly carried out via the teleconference system and the online document tools such as e-mail. The facility equipped with necessary electronic devices and furniture has been effectively used. A Thai dentist appointed as Visiting Assistant Professor at TMDU have served to operate the program smoothly and efficiently.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> The structure of the committees was very well improved after the establishment to take care each important task. The communication between the two universities as well as among the sub committees were well established and performed as often as its necessary.</p>	

Assessment Category

1-2. Policies

(Self-assessment report page 7)

Criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Diploma Policy is determined based on the educational objectives and published, and completion of the program is approved in a fair and strict manner. (1-2-1) ➤ Curriculum Policy is clearly indicated and published based on the educational objectives. (1-2-2) ➤ Academic curricula are organized and implemented based on Curriculum Policy. (1-2-2) ➤ Clear Admissions Policy is established and entrance examination is conducted in accordance with the policy. (1-2-3) 	
Self-assessment	Rating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The current policies, both diploma and curriculum, are performed very well. ▪ The Diploma Policy, Curriculum Policy and Admissions Policy have been well applied and conducted.
	III	
External review	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I
	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The diploma, curriculum and admission policies have been applied to the process for selecting students and the implementation of the program.</p> <p>A level required for English proficiency has been adjusted. The effect of this modification needs to be verified in the coming years.</p> <p>A curriculum policy should always be coherent to a diploma policy. In this sense, it seems desirable that the curriculum policy (Table 2) contains an appropriate subject for cultivating student’s ability to act as a global leader.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> The policy shows all the requirements for graduation. The curriculum provides what to be taught to the students in details.</p> <p>Even the admission criteria in English scores was adjusted but still in appropriate level to assure the students are capable to graduate with high qualities.</p>

Assessment Category

1-3. Quality assurance system

(Self-assessment report page 12)

<p>Criteria</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Self-assessment is implemented and the results are published, and reflected in the educational and research activities. (1-3-1) ➤ After carrying out the external assessment, the results are published and reflected in educational and research activities. (1-3-2) ➤ Opinions of university members (students and faculty members) obtained in order to ensure proper use of the results in concrete, sustainable improvement of educational quality. (1-3-3) ➤ Opinions of external parties are utilized properly toward concrete, sustainable improvement of educational quality (1-3-3) ➤ Faculty development is properly managed, and leads to improvement of educational quality and coursework. (1-3-3) ➤ Information such as that on educational activities (including the items defined in paragraph 2, article 172 of the Enforcement regulations of the school education Law, MEXT) will be publicized. (1-3-4) 				
<p>Self-assessment</p>	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">Rating</td> <td rowspan="2" style="padding: 5px;"> <p>The program has the complete quality assurance system comprising self-assessment, external assessment, feedback of assessment result and publication. Self-assessment of the program is planned to be undergone in January, 2019, and external assessment is planned to be undergone during January to March, 2019. The complete external assessment report will be finalized in March 2019. The feedback of external assessment will be publicized, and shared with faculty members through faculty development. Information of the program is publicized on the website.</p> </td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">III</td> </tr> </table>	Rating	<p>The program has the complete quality assurance system comprising self-assessment, external assessment, feedback of assessment result and publication. Self-assessment of the program is planned to be undergone in January, 2019, and external assessment is planned to be undergone during January to March, 2019. The complete external assessment report will be finalized in March 2019. The feedback of external assessment will be publicized, and shared with faculty members through faculty development. Information of the program is publicized on the website.</p>	III	
Rating	<p>The program has the complete quality assurance system comprising self-assessment, external assessment, feedback of assessment result and publication. Self-assessment of the program is planned to be undergone in January, 2019, and external assessment is planned to be undergone during January to March, 2019. The complete external assessment report will be finalized in March 2019. The feedback of external assessment will be publicized, and shared with faculty members through faculty development. Information of the program is publicized on the website.</p>				
III					
<p>External review</p>	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">Rating (Please circle)</td> <td style="text-align: center;">IV · III · II · I</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Comments</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"> <p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The quality assurance of the JDP has been completed through self-assessment, external assessment, and the feedback and publication of assessment results. The quality assurance system is further planned in 2020.</p> <p>It would be informative especially for those who wish to apply to the JDP if more detailed information on research activities at TMDU could be available on the</p> </td> </tr> </table>	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The quality assurance of the JDP has been completed through self-assessment, external assessment, and the feedback and publication of assessment results. The quality assurance system is further planned in 2020.</p> <p>It would be informative especially for those who wish to apply to the JDP if more detailed information on research activities at TMDU could be available on the</p>
Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I				
Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The quality assurance of the JDP has been completed through self-assessment, external assessment, and the feedback and publication of assessment results. The quality assurance system is further planned in 2020.</p> <p>It would be informative especially for those who wish to apply to the JDP if more detailed information on research activities at TMDU could be available on the</p>				

		<p>website.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote></p> <p>The self-assessments were performed according to the plan.</p> <p>The results from previous evaluation were used for improving the following year program.</p> <p>Voice from the students and stakeholders were collected and used as data for program developments.</p> <p>All the important quality assurance system were well carried on, analyzed and planned.</p>
--	--	---

2. Operation of JD Program

Assessment Category

2-1. Progress of JD Program operation
(Self-assessment report page 17)

Criteria	➤ Program is operated properly as planned.	
Self-assessment	Rating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Written examination, wire-bending examination and essay examination were conducted at CU. Subsequent joint interview was conducted through video conferencing system. CU and TMDU jointly conducted the entrance examination 2018, and 3 students were matriculated to JDP. ▪ The guidance of the research topics during TMDU professors' visit to CU in August 2018 was very helpful to the students. ▪ For the students matriculated in 2017, the Qualifying Examination was done in the middle of the 2nd semester of the 1st year. The students had their own research topics from the Qualifying Examination so they could start their research at TMDU. ▪ For the students matriculated in 2016, they finished the research part in TMDU and continued their research work in CU. The dissertation proposal examination was done in November 2018. They started their clinical work by accepting new orthodontic patients, doing the diagnostic and treatment planning work to prepare the treatment of the patients in 2nd semester.
	III	
External review	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I
	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> Students matriculated in 2017 finished their research at TMDU and returned to CU to continue their work, while doing their clinical work at the orthodontic department at CU.</p> <p>In 2018, after examinations and interview, three new</p>

	<p>students were selected and enrolled as planned. Guidance, registration for subjects for the first semester, orientation to research activity, and assignment of supervisors were all smoothly conducted jointly by TMDU and CU. They started their own dissertation studies at TMDU.</p> <p>Three new students were finally recruited for enrollment in 2019.</p> <p>All these progresses highlight the fact that the JDP have been well operated as planned.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> All important examinations were arranged and carried on based on the plan to assure that the students could enter the program as well as graduate. The recruitment problem was figured out appropriately by adjusting the score but still within an appropriate level to assure the qualities of the students.</p>
--	---

Assessment Category

**2-2. Fulfillment of student capacity
(Self-assessment report page 20)**

Criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Admissions Policy, Curriculum Policy and Diploma Policy are properly publicized and disseminated. ➤ Number of enrollments versus admissions quota is appropriate. 	
Self-assessment	Rating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The ratios of number of admission/number of applicants were 3/9 in 2016, 3/6 in 2017, and 3/7 in 2018. Student capacity fulfilled in 2016, 2017 and 2018. ▪ Information on the curriculum is easily assessed on the first page of CU's website. Applicants can find more details on the graduate school office website when they start the application process.
	III	
External review	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I
	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> Although the number of applicants has decreased gradually year by year, three students were admitted every year as planned.</p> <p>Information necessary for admission is available on the website.</p> <p>The recruitment of Japanese students is an important challenge. Any drastic measures should be taken to improve the situation.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> Even though, the number of the applicants was decreased, it based on the facts that the program has high requirements for screening the students so that only high standard students can enter the later on can graduate from the program on time.</p>

Assessment Category

2-3. Syllabuses

(Self-assessment report page 22)

Criteria	➤ Appropriate syllabuses have been prepared and are in operation.	
Self-assessment	Rating	The syllabuses for JDP have been properly prepared in English and Thai and have been on CU website.
	III	
External review	Rating (Please circle)	IV · (III) · II · I
	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> Detailed course syllabuses are available on the websites in English and Japanese.</p> <p>Although it is stated in the self-assessment report that syllabus in Thai has been uploaded, the reviewer cannot find it on the CU website.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> Since the program was operated for many years, the syllabus was very often improved so that the syllabus must be appropriately prepared and operated.</p>

Assessment Category

2-4. Evaluation method and criteria

(Self-assessment report page 23)

Criteria	➤ Evaluation methods and criteria (grading, recognition of credits, and completion of the course) are established for each subject. They are being conducted properly in a fair manner, and have been disclosed to students.	
Self-assessment	Rating	The grading system was well established. The grade conversion is now being used effectively.
	III	
External review	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I
	Comments	<Dr. Koichi Kato> Grading and grade conversion have been well conducted with no apparent problems. <Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> All the evaluated methods for each subject were well established, published and conducted based on the program evaluation.

3. Student Support

Assessment Category

3-1. Student support system

(Self-assessment report page 26)

Criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Appropriate housing support for students is ensured. (3-1-1) ➤ Educational environment that provides education according to instruction goals is established. (3-1-2) ➤ Adequate financial support for students is ensured. (3-1-3) 			
Self-assessment	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">Rating</td> <td rowspan="2" style="padding: 5px;"> <p>Besides the scholarship mentioned above, there is a scholarship called “100th Anniversary Chulalongkorn University Fund for Doctoral Scholarship” for the Ph.D. students. All 2nd and 3rd year students have got the scholarship. Therefore the students can be somehow alleviated from their financial burden. Three 1st-year students also have a plan to apply for this scholarship. In Japan, few scholarships are available to JDP students because most of them have to be applied for during a particular period.</p> </td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center; vertical-align: middle;">IV</td> </tr> </table>	Rating	<p>Besides the scholarship mentioned above, there is a scholarship called “100th Anniversary Chulalongkorn University Fund for Doctoral Scholarship” for the Ph.D. students. All 2nd and 3rd year students have got the scholarship. Therefore the students can be somehow alleviated from their financial burden. Three 1st-year students also have a plan to apply for this scholarship. In Japan, few scholarships are available to JDP students because most of them have to be applied for during a particular period.</p>	IV
	Rating	<p>Besides the scholarship mentioned above, there is a scholarship called “100th Anniversary Chulalongkorn University Fund for Doctoral Scholarship” for the Ph.D. students. All 2nd and 3rd year students have got the scholarship. Therefore the students can be somehow alleviated from their financial burden. Three 1st-year students also have a plan to apply for this scholarship. In Japan, few scholarships are available to JDP students because most of them have to be applied for during a particular period.</p>		
IV				
External review	<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 15%; text-align: center;">Rating (Please circle)</td> <td style="text-align: center;"> IV · III · II · I </td> </tr> </table>	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I	
	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I		
<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 15%; text-align: center; vertical-align: middle;">Comments</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"> <p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The progress of research may vary depending on the students. The reviewer recommends that self-assessment is also involved in the analysis of these progresses in more detail.</p> <p>Due to a great effort by TMDU and CU, current students have ever received financial supports every year. However, it seems that a more substantial scholarship would attract those who consider application to the JDP.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> Housing was well provided. Educational environment was excellent for learning at both universities. Funding, which was not promise before entering the program, was provided to support the students.</p> </td> </tr> </table>	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The progress of research may vary depending on the students. The reviewer recommends that self-assessment is also involved in the analysis of these progresses in more detail.</p> <p>Due to a great effort by TMDU and CU, current students have ever received financial supports every year. However, it seems that a more substantial scholarship would attract those who consider application to the JDP.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> Housing was well provided. Educational environment was excellent for learning at both universities. Funding, which was not promise before entering the program, was provided to support the students.</p>		
Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> The progress of research may vary depending on the students. The reviewer recommends that self-assessment is also involved in the analysis of these progresses in more detail.</p> <p>Due to a great effort by TMDU and CU, current students have ever received financial supports every year. However, it seems that a more substantial scholarship would attract those who consider application to the JDP.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> Housing was well provided. Educational environment was excellent for learning at both universities. Funding, which was not promise before entering the program, was provided to support the students.</p>			

Conclusion

Conclusion	Rating (Please circle)	IV · III · II · I
	Comments	<p><Dr. Koichi Kato> As a whole, the JDP appears to be well operated by TMDU and CU as planned. Every year, three students were successfully enrolled and have taken the course with no complications. These students could receive financial supports as well as assistance with regard to housing and research environments.</p> <p>As mentioned earlier, more detailed analysis on the progress of dissertation research will serve to enhance the effectiveness of the assessment.</p> <p>It is also recommended that TMDU and CU make further efforts to provide substantial scholarship systems to attract more students.</p> <p>As far as the reviewer understood, the Japanese government generally requires bidirectional student exchange in the framework of a joint degree program. However, the recruitment of Japanese students is probably challenging, and therefore it is recommended to consider any strategic and fundamental measures to attract Japanese students.</p> <p><Dr. Chairat Charoemratrote> Since the score from the 1st section is III, the 2nd section is III with IV from the last section, the average would be III.</p>